

### WASHINGTON, D.C. | VIRGINIA | ARIZONA

11808 WOLF RUN LANE CLIFTON, VA 20124 (202) 466-6937 | FAX (202) 466-6937

2730 S. VAL VISTA DR **BUILDING 6, SUITE 133** GILBERT, AZ 85295 (602) 388-8899 | FAX (602) 393-4361

May 22, 2018

1050 SEVENTEENTH STREET, N.W. **SUITE 600** WASHINGTON, D.C. 20036 (202) 466-6937 | FAX (602) 393-4361

Peter A. Arhangelsky, Esq.

parhangelsky@emord.com

(602) 388-8899

# VIA E-MAIL AND UPS OVERNIGHT

Jonathan O. Hafen jhafen@parrbrown.com Jonathan Schofield jschofield@parrbrown.com Cynthia D. Love clove@parrbrown.com 101 South 200 East Salt Lake City, UT 84111

Mr. Todd Smith Wakaya Perfection, LLC 13413 N. Alpine Cove Dr. Alpine, UT 84004

> 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & Re: SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

To Whom it May Concern:

As you know, we represent Youngevity International, Corp. ("Youngevity") in Youngevity International Corp., et al. v. Wakaya Perfection, et. al., Case No. 3:16-cv-704-W-JLB (S.D. Cal.) ("YGYI v. Wakaya"). During its investigation of Wakaya's business and product offerings, Youngevity discovered that Wakaya is in violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Prop 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code § 25248.5 et seq., concerning the products listed below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because Wakaya has failed to provide clear and reasonable warnings concerning, inter alia, the excessive acrylamide content in the products listed below.

This notice provides the essential notice of violations of California's Proposition 65. Those violations are significant and pose an immediate threat to public safety. The acrylamide exposure levels caused by ingestion or use of Wakaya's products hereinbelow identified are significantly higher than permissible under state thresholds.

<u>General Information about Proposition 65.</u> A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is attached with the copy of this letter served to the Alleged Violator.

<u>Alleged Violator.</u> The name of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 is:

## Wakaya Perfection, LLC

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemicals.</u> The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

Ginger Gems –Acrylamide
Lemon Gems –Acrylamide
Paradise Product Pack –Acrylamide
Paradise Holiday Pack (2016) –Acrylamide
Chef Pack –Acrylamide
Ginger Gift Pack –Acrylamide
Turmeric Gift Pack –Acrylamide
BulaFIT 7-day Trial Pack-Lead

On February January 1, 1990, the State of California officially listed acrylamide as a chemical known to cause cancer. On February 25, 2011, the State of California officially listed acrylamide as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity. On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

Youngevity may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling, and recommended use of those products. The primary route of exposure to those chemicals has been and continues to be through ingestion.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least approximately February 2016, when the Alleged Violator became the exclusive distributor for those products, as well as every day since that time the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from, or reduced to allowable levels in, the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Alleged Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons handling and/or using these products with appropriate warning that they are being exposed to those chemicals.

Youngevity is a company that promotes consumer well-being and longevity through sound dietary habits. Youngevity exercises great care to ensure that its products are lawful and safe for consumption. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a preference to have these ongoing violations of California law remedied expeditiously, Youngevity seeks a constructive resolution that includes an enforceable agreement executed by Wakaya to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (2) payment of an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution would prevent further undisclosed consumer exposures, as well as additional and expensive time-consuming litigation. Without such prompt remedial measures, Youngevity intends to pursue a claim under Prop 65 consistent with the public interest.

Youngevity cannot finalize any settlement under after the 60-day notice period has expired or speak for the Attorney General or any district or city attorneys wo received this Notice. Therefore, any settlement between Wakaya and Youngevity may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violations to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead.

Sincerely

Peter A. Arhangelsk

Counsel to Youngevity International Corp.

### Attachments:

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service OEHHA Summary (to Wakaya Perfection, LLC's counsel-of-record only) Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Youngevity International Corp.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Wakaya Perfection, LLC

I, Peter A. Arhangelsky, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of merit accompanies the attached amended 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice violated California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of this notice.
- 4. Based on information obtained through those consultants, which includes laboratory and analytical data related to the products at issue, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides credible bases that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General, we have attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: May 22, 2018

Peter A. Arhangelsky

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within entitled action. My business address is 2730 S. Val Vista Drive, Building 6, Suite #133, Gilbert, AZ 85295. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The enveloped or package was placed in the mail in Gilbert, Arizona.

On May 22, 2018, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by e-mail or by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below and sending though UPS with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

### Via UPS:

Todd Smith Registered Agent for Wakaya Perfection, LLC 13413 N. Alpine Cove Dr. Alpine, UT 84004

Current President, CEO, Manager, or Managing Member Wakaya Perfection, LLC 7 South 1550 West Suite 600 Lindon, UT 84042

### Via Email:

Jonathan O. Hafen jhafen@parrbrown.com
Jonathan Schofield
jschofield@parrbrown.com
Cynthia D. Love
clove@parrbrown.com

On May 22, 2018, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION**, **CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFCATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d)(1)** on the following party by uploading a true and correct copy thereof on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On May 22, 2018, I served the following documents:

- 60-Day Notice of Violation
- Certificate of Merit

On each of the parties on the service list attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the service list attached hereto, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by First Class Mail.

On May 22, 2018, I served the following documents:

- 60-Day Notice of Violation
- Certificate of Merit

On the following party by causing a true and correct .PDF copy thereof to be sent via electronic mail to the party listed below, pursuant to Cal. Code Regs., title. 27, § 25903(c)(1):

Lassen County District Attorney mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us
San Luis Obispo County District Attorney edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Santa Clara County District Attorney EPU@da.sccgov.org
Sonoma County District Attorney jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
Tulare County District Attorney Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Ventura County District Attorney daspecialops@ventura.org
Yolo County District Attorney cfepd@yolocounty.org

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on May 22, 2018

Peter A. Arhangelsky

#### **SERVICE LIST**

Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612

Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street #202 Jackson, CA 95642

Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward St Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

Inyo County District Attorney 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526

Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301

Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 Lassen County District Attorney 220 South Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 [field\_prop65ctacts\_title] mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101

Mono County District Attorney 278 Main St Bridgeport, CA 93517

Monterey County District Attorney 1200 Aguajito Rd Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Napa County District Attorney Carithers Building 931 Parkway Mall P.O. Box 720 Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678 Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

Riverside County District Attorney 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203

San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco County District Attorney 732 Brannan St San Francisco, CA 94103 gregory.alker@sfgov.org

San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

San Luis Obispo County District Attorney 1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 [field\_prop65ctacts\_title] edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936

Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354

Sutter County District Attorney 466 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991

Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080

Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

Tulare County District Attorney 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 | Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113